

INDEPENDENT TECHNICAL EVALUATION (GATE 1 & 2)

Scheme Name:
Date Completed:
Completed By:

South East Local Enterprise Partnership Business Case Review Pro-Forma: Strategic Case

Question	Value / Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	R/A/G Status	Commentary	R/A/G Status
Overall: How compelling is the case for the scheme? – strategic and economic			High/Medium/Low		High/Medium/Low
1) Is there evidence to show that there is a need for intervention?			High/Medium/Low		High/Medium/Low
Has a scope for the scheme been defined?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Have current problems been identified?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Have problems in the future been identified?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Does the scheme address the problems?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Have other opportunities for the scheme been identified?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Is there a case to say why the scheme is needed now?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
2) Have objectives been appropriately defined?			High/Medium/Low		High/Medium/Low
Do the objectives capture the context/problems which ground the need for the scheme?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Have the objectives been developed to align with the objectives and outlooks of national/sub-regional/local planning policies?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
How well does the scheme align to the objectives?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

Question	Value / Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	R/A/G Status	Commentary	R/A/G Status
3) Have alternative options been defined?			High/Medium/Low		High/Medium/Low
What is the basis to the generation of alternative options?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Is the case for the discounting of alternative options compelling?			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
4) Does the case identify other factors affecting the suitability of the preferred option?			High/Medium/Low		High/Medium/Low
Constraints			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Dependencies/ Interdependencies			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
5) Does the case identify risks affecting delivery of the scheme?			High/Medium/Low		High/Medium/Low
Key Risks			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Stakeholder Awareness			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Powers and Consents			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

INDEPENDENT TECHNICAL EVALUATION (GATE 1 & 2)

South East Local Enterprise Partnership Business Case Review Pro-Forma: Economic Case

Scheme Name:
Date Completed:
Completed By:

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
General		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Relevant Government Guidelines followed and version			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Market prices			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Consistent units			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Discount year			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Appraisal period			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Forecast years			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Opening year			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Sensitivity testing			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Capital Cost		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Price base			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Spend profile			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Treatment of sunk costs			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Inflation assumptions			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
QRA appropriateness			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Optimism bias allowance			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Local contribution			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Consistency with scheme			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Other Costs		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Price base			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Operating costs			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Maintenance costs			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Renewals costs			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
Inflation assumptions/capping			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Public/private allocations			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Consistency with scheme			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Benefits		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Recognised Appraisal Spreadsheet Tool used (or similar bespoke)			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Appropriateness of appraisal inputs (age/source/units)			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Appropriate approach to benefits calculation (approach/forecast)			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Appropriate consideration and presentation of the counterfactual / deadweight (e.g. 'Do Nothing' or 'Do Minimum' Scenario)			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Annualisation approach (if appropriate)			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Displacement, leakage and substitution considered suitably (if appropriate)			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Multipliers considered suitably			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Approach to qualitative impacts clearly explained			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Consistency with scheme			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Revenue		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Derivation			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Revenues and implied yield			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Public/private allocations			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Assumed operator/delivery partner/beneficiary response			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
Are Exchequer impacts considered separately (e.g. changes to tax base or reduction in benefits) except where permitted.			Red/Amber/Green		
Appraisal Outputs		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
NPV			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
BCR			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
VfM			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

INDEPENDENT TECHNICAL EVALUATION (GATE 1 & 2)

Scheme Name:
Date Completed:
Completed By:

South East Local
Enterprise Partnership
Business Case Review Pro-
Forma:
Commercial Case

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Contracting strategy			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Procurement strategy			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Market maturity			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Procurement experience			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Risk allocation			Red/Amber/ Green		Red/Amber/Green
Consistency with other cases			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

INDEPENDENT TECHNICAL EVALUATION (GATE 1 & 2)

Scheme Name:
Date Completed:
Completed By:

South East Local Enterprise Partnership Business Case Review Pro-Forma: Financial Case

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
Financial estimates (capital)		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Funding requirement			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Accuracy of funding requirement			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Inflation assumptions			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Time-consistency			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Overheads and uplifts			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Risk and uncertainty			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Contingency and optimism bias			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Financial procedures		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Funding mechanism			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Availability of funds			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Funding profile			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Funding commitment			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Funding risks			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Funding constraints			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Financial estimates (non-capital)		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Non-capital funding mechanism			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Non-capital funding profile			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Accuracy of non-capital funding requirement			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Non-capital inflation assumptions			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
Revenue forecasts			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Ramp-up assumptions			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Operating surplus			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

INDEPENDENT TECHNICAL EVALUATION (GATE 1 & 2)

Scheme Name:
Date Completed:
Completed By:

South East Local
Enterprise Partnership
Business Case Review Pro-
Forma:
Management Case

Category/Topic	Value/Source	G1 Review		G2 Review	
		Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept	Commentary	Red – Reject Amber – Defer Green – Accept
Management Case		Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low	Rating for overall uncertainty:	High/Medium/Low
Project sponsor			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Wider governance			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Approval procedures			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Stakeholder engagement plan			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Risk management strategy			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Availability and suitability of resources			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Work programme			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Project/programme management			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Monitoring and evaluation			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green
Benefits realisation			Red/Amber/Green		Red/Amber/Green

Reviewer Summary Comments

1. Has a sensible and proportionate methodology been applied?

2. Has the methodology been applied accurately?

3. Has the analysis either reduced or helped to expose/ understand uncertainty?